New Paradigms and Tools for Teaching and Assessing Professionalism in the Health Sciences

John D. Mahan, MD
Program Director, Pediatric Residency and Pediatric Nephrology Fellowship Programs
Associate Director, OSU Center for Faculty Advancement, Mentoring and Engagement (FAME)
Nationwide Children's Hospital/The Ohio State University
Objectives

1. Define 3 models for framing professionalism in the health sciences
2. Describe 3 effective methods for teaching professionalism in the health sciences
3. Describe 3 effective methods for assessing professionalism in health science learners
4. Identify 1-2 methods that you can explore using in teaching and/or assessing professionalism in your learners
Professionalism

- “There seems to be no agreement on what the term (i.e., professionalism) means.” DeAngelis
- “Role modeling must be combined with reflection on the action to truly teach professionalism.” Stern
- “Because of the nature of professionalism, no single tool for assessing it among medical learners and practicing physicians exists.” Mueller
- “Indeed, if the values and commitment that have made modern medicine possible, creating both the powerfully effective technologies and forging the therapeutic partnership with patients, are lost, then medicine will very quickly run into serious difficulties.” Tallis
Professionalism

“\You are in this profession as a calling, not as a business; as a calling which extracts from you at every turn self-sacrifice, devotion, love and tenderness to your fellow man. We must work in the missionary spirit with a breadth of charity that raises you far above the petty jealousies of life.”  Osler
Professionalism in the 21st Century

Situated in complex, challenging world
Roots in traditions and age-old truths
Multiple approaches, multiple insights
We need to do better in educating, assessing, reinforcing Professionalism in our learners, and ourselves
Professionalism Models

Virtue

Identity

Behavior

Model 1 - Virtues

- Moral character
- Moral reasoning
- Humanism
Model 2 - Behaviors

- Behaviors
- Milestones
- Competencies
Model 3 – Professional Identity

- Developmental
- Socialization
- Social compact
Question 1

Given that all 3 Professionalism models (constructs) have a long history and real value, which one speaks most powerfully to you as a means to frame the professionalism development and assessment of your learners?
# Professionalism Models

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Models</th>
<th>Assumptions (Actions result from......)</th>
<th>Strengths</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Virtue based</td>
<td>Internalizing right values and ethics until habits created</td>
<td>Internal values first, moral reasoning later</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Behavior based</td>
<td>Clear expectations, feedback and reinforcement</td>
<td>Expectations, direct feedback and evaluation for competence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professional identity</td>
<td>Developed identity by socialization and community of practice</td>
<td>Developmental arc to ‘proper’ identity</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Adapted from: Irby, Hamstra. Acad Med 2016
Professionalism Development: Methods

**Virtue:**
Help learners internalize and gain virtues; use moral reasoning.

**Behavior:**
Clarify expectations, teach behaviors, provide feedback and sanctions.

**Professional Identity:**
Provide positive role models, warn against negative role models.
Professionalism Education: Principles

Needed

Must assure professionalism knowledge & skills
Can not assume without teaching

No Single Method

No consensus on best method
Multimodal more likely to take

No Assumptions

Need to develop professionalism competencies
Assessment drives learning
Professionalism Education: Methods

- Reflection/Discussion
- Lecture
- Case-Based Discussion
- Sentinel Events
- Forum/Panel
- Reflective Writing
Professionalism Education: Methods

Match the educational method to the underlying Professionalism model
Professionalism Education: Selection

- Lecture
- Case-Based Discussion
- Sentinel Events
- Forum/ Panels
- Reflection/Discussion
- Reflective Writing

Virtues
Behaviors
Identity Formation
Professionalism Virtues and Values

**Professional Values**
- Altruism
- Integrity and Honesty
- Respect
- Confidentiality
- Excellence
- Caring and Compassion
- Communication
- Prudence
- Responsibility and Accountability

**Project Tenets**
- Professionalism*
- Altruism
- Accountability
- Excellence
- Duty
- Honor and Integrity
- Respect for Others

*Tenets
Professionalism Lapses: The Iceberg and the Swiss Cheese

Good health professionals find themselves in difficult situations

Often many factors and missed opportunities must occur for an error (professionalism problem) to become manifest
Concepts from Error Analysis

Culture Change: Prevent, not Punish

Goal: Understand, Prevent, Educate
Blame free
Root cause analysis
Categories of error to guide analysis

Why Might a Professionalism Lapse Occur?
Deficiencies in: Knowledge; Judgment; Skills; Systems

To Err is Human, Building a Safer Health System, IOM, 1999
## New Professionalism Paradigm

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Conventional Method</th>
<th>Professionalism Error Method</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Professionalism is..</strong></td>
<td>Character trait</td>
<td>Resiliency!</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Perceived lapses are..</strong></td>
<td>Character flaw, Sanction/deem as bad</td>
<td>Common, happens to good people</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Teach by..</strong></td>
<td>Rules, rituals, role modeling</td>
<td>Develop Knowledge, Judgment, Skills, Systems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Evaluate by...</strong></td>
<td>Assume professional, until lapse is seen</td>
<td>Observe, under low/high stress</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Most situations have more than one “right” solution
Most problematic situations result from conflicts between competing values

Example: A student is instructed by his attending to not tell a patient her diagnosis is then asked by the patient if he knows the diagnosis.

Case – Based Discussion

It is Friday morning and you are struggling to get through rounds and get to clinic. You are paged by Case Management and berated because one of your patients has been in the hospital now for over 2 days and does not have certification note. He demands that you enter that note now so that the hospital will be able to get paid for this admission.

How do you remain professional?
Professional Identity Formation

- Addresses such critical questions for the developing professional such as “Who am I?” and “Who do I want to become?”
- Model integrates internal processes and values with behaviors that are typically developed through socialization by experienced members of the profession.
- Learner comes to think, feel and act like a physician in the context of the internal and social environment.
- Professional is grounded in social expectations of the profession - able to act like and be a physician and deliver on the compact between the profession and society.
Professional Identity Formation

Who do I want to become?

Modelling

Assimilation of values

Actions/Behaviors
### Professionalism Models: Assessment Strategies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Virtues</th>
<th>Behaviors</th>
<th>Professional identity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Written exams</td>
<td>Written exams</td>
<td>Reflective (self-assessment) exercises</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reflective (self-assessment) exercises</td>
<td>Reflective (self-assessment) exercises</td>
<td>Multisource assessments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Observation/feedback</td>
<td>Observation/feedback</td>
<td>Moral reasoning exercises</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moral reasoning exercises</td>
<td>Multisource assessments</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Critical incident/lapses reports</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Professionalism MEX</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Adapted from: Irby, Hamstra. Acad Med 2016
Professionalism Assessment: Challenges

- Lack of clarity about best educational methods & assessments
- Complexity of modern society
- Recognition of moral imperative
- Many choices

*Thoughtful attempts, with sound bases, and careful application, can add value to our learners, our profession and society!*
Question 2

Which Professionalism assessment models do you currently use with your learners?
# Professionalism Assessment Methods

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Methods</th>
<th>Examples</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Observed Clinical Encounter</strong></td>
<td>P-MEX, Standardized Direct Observation Tool</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Multisource Feedback</strong></td>
<td>Multisource assessment tools</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Simulation/Observed Structured Clinical Exam</strong></td>
<td>Patient simulation with ethical dilemmas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Global Evaluation</strong></td>
<td>Rotation, course evaluations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Patient Feedback</strong></td>
<td>RCP Patient Questionnaire, Wake Forest Physician Trust Scheme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Self-Assessment</strong></td>
<td>Groningen Reflection Ability Scale, Interpersonal Reactivity Index</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Reflection/Essays</strong></td>
<td>Reflective writing grading/discussion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Knowledge/Moral Reasoning Exams</strong></td>
<td>Case based scenarios: MCQ, essays</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Professionalism Lapses/Critical Incident Reports</strong></td>
<td>Formal evaluation of observed lapse or self-reported critical incident</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Adapted from: Wilkinson. Acad Med 2009
Professionalism Mini-Evaluation Exercise (P-MEX)

- Mini-CEX framework –
  - Structured Clinical Observation
  - Observed Structured Clinical Exercise
- Evaluates 21 specific behaviors
- Trained raters
- Valuable for formative assessment, feedback, reflection

Standardized Direct Observation Assessment Tool (SDOT)

- Not Professionalism specific
  - contains useful professionalism items in context of clinical encounter
- High inter-rater agreement with minimal training
- Good real world applicability – practical
- Useful for formative feedback and evaluation
- Use of other Direct Observation tools

360° Multisource Feedback (MSF)

- Widely used construct in industry; increasing use in academia
- Good MSF models for formative decisions and feedback about professional behaviors
- Best practices: Large sample of raters (10–30) clustered into groups, rating scales on professionalism competencies, consistent anchor responses, paper vrs online, proper and timely feedback critical to formative assessment process
- Challenges in implementation – potentially great value

Berk. Med Teach 2009
Reflection – a Window to Professionalism Development & Status

- Reflection on real cases, clinical scenarios and/or professional interactions
- Insights can be important starting point for discussion/exploration
- Groningen Reflection Ability Scale (GRAS) – 23 items, 5-point Likert = 1 GRAS score (some ability to explore domain scores)
- GRAS measures personal reflection on important multi-facetted medical problems - one-dimensional scale, covering 3 relevant aspects of personal reflection: self-reflection, empathetic reflection, reflective communication

Aukes. Med Teach 2007
Professionalism Climate Assessment

- Professionalism milieu is important for the learner and can reveal much about the ‘hidden curricula’ for the learner
- Formative evaluation of the professionalism climate within a department/work area by learners and faculty (‘power of the group’)
  - provide ‘needs assessment’ to direct education
  - identify specific areas for improvement (systems issues)
- Penn State Professionalism Questionnaire
- OSU Professionalism Climate Survey
Professionalism Climate Assessment

- Penn State Professionalism Questionnaire
  - 36 items (ABIM)
  - 7 factors of professionalism

- OSU Professionalism Climate Survey
  - 36 items [based on Safety Attitudes Questionnaire]
  - 7 factors of professional behavior (including teamwork)
  - More behaviorally based

Sexton. BMC HSR 2006
Mahan. CGEA 2016
Question 3

Which Professionalism assessment tool would you like to explore using with your learners?

And why?
Choosing Professionalism Assessments

1. Define the Professionalism model underlying the assessment tool to be employed.
2. Link assessment to educational task and effort – what is being taught/learned.
3. Multiple assessment methods are superior to 1!
4. Utilize assessments that address multiple Professionalism models (best if all 3).
Professionalism Assessment: A Team Sport

Questions?
Summary

1. The 3 Professionalism models: virtues, behavior, professionalism identity – are useful constructs for learners and teachers.
2. There are multiple methods to teach Professionalism – multiple methods that complement each are have the greatest impact.
3. There are multiple methods developed to assess Professionalism from at least 10 different assessment methods - multiple methods addressing important Professionalism constructs can allow useful approximation of the learner’s state and areas for further development.
4. Assessment of the Professionalism climate can provide a valuable 360° measure of the ‘hidden curriculum’ surrounding your learners.
Commitment to Action

Identify 1-2 methods that you can explore using in teaching and/or assessing professionalism in your learners

Action 1. ___________________________________________
Action 2. ___________________________________________

Commit to:

a) read more
b) discuss with colleague
c) try/implement
References

19. Al-Eraky MM. Twelve Tips for teaching medical professionalism at all levels of medical education, Medical Teacher. 2015;37:1018-1025.
The practice of medicine is an art, not a trade; a calling, not a business; a calling in which your heart will be exercised equally with your head.